



Department of Trauma Surgery and Emergency Medicine
Medical University of Lublin
20-081 Lublin, Staszica 16 st., ☎, fax: 81 532 18 54
Chair of the Department:
Dr hab. med. Adam Nogalski prof. nadzw.
e-mail:chirurgiaurazowalublin@tlen.pl



Lublin 8 listopada 2016r.

***Review report of the PhD thesis of Thomas Wilp entitled:
„A Comparison of European Emergency Medical Services and the
Possibility of Implementing a Standardized Training Curriculum for
a Future European Paramedic Profession”.***

In accordance with the resolution of 26.09. 2016 passed by The Council of the Faculty of Health Sciences with Subfaculty of Nursing and Institute of Maritime and Tropical Medicine, Medical University of Gdańsk, which appointed me to fulfil the obligations of the reviewer in the doctoral programme followed by Mr Thomas Wilp, I present my review of the thesis developed under academic supervision of prof Jerzy Lasek.

The reviewed dissertation of Thomas Wilp presented for my evaluation is written in English and concerns comparison of european emergency medical services and the possibility of implementing a standardized training curriculum for a future european paramedic profession.

Dziekanat Wydziału Nauk o Zdrowiu

18 LIS. 2016

Wpł. dnia.....

Nr-DNZ/ 564 / 2016

Author undertook a very difficult task of analyzing the functionality of pre-hospital emergency medicine structures in all European countries with particular emphasis on the assessment of the training process and medical staff competence gain in this process.

Due to historical determination in different European countries, organizational solutions of medical rescue services differ significantly. Differences occur not only between European countries, but also between given regions, which depends on the degree of urbanization, geographical conditions as well as economical possibilities and access to other structures of health care. Constant and very fast progress of medicine leads to a necessity to make changes also in the structures of rescue services. It is highly important for the rescue services personnel to obtain knowledge, skills and competences suitable for opportunities raised by modern medicine. This task can only be realized by an appropriate, standardized process of education and then evaluation along with recertification of educational outcomes. Law regulations of European Union Member States oblige them to provide all the EU citizens with an equal access to medical services regardless of place of any sudden event. In order to fulfill this condition it is necessary to develop the minimal criteria of permissions and competences for the units working in the structures of medical rescue services and creating an institution monitoring the effects of such actions in all of the European countries. This is why studies such as this dissertation by Tomas Wilp, which comprehensively explore the mentioned above problems, are so important.

Presented dissertation of Thomas Wilp was written in English. The work consist of 188 pages and it is divided into seven main parts:

1. Introduction (7 pages), Historical Background (10 pages), The German EMS (18 pages), Integrative Literature Review (14 pages), Cross-sectional Survey (18 pages), Synthesis of Findings (11 pages), Conclusions and Recommendations (10 pages). Furthermore, the dissertation includes: Abstract in English and in Polish (2 pages each), List of abbreviations, Glossary, List of European Countries, 18 Figures and 18 Tables. The thesis ends with References on 13 pages includes 225 items in alphabetical order and V Appendices on 89 pages.

The introduction (chapters 1 to 3) is clear evidence that the Author knows the issue very well and is substantially prepared to conduct research. In the first three chapters author systematizes concepts regarding issues connected with medical rescue services which are discussed in the following chapters. Very educative part of this dissertation is presentation of the historical background of medical rescue services development in Europe with a specific mention of preclinical emergency medicine in Germany.

In the next two chapters (4 and 5) author presents methodology of his research which includes interactive literature review and cross sectional survey. From the scientific point of view methodology chosen by the Author is adequate to the meter of thesis and fulfills any criteria of scientific research.

In chapters 6 and 7 author presents most significant results of his studies and based on them formulates recommendations on legislation and financing, education and training and paramedic competencies. Chapter 7 includes part called "discussion" being only 2 pages of text, however the proper comparison of own results with the results of other authors makes much larger parts of chapters 6 and 7. There, it is mixed with presenting own results with

conclusions, making them harder to analyze by the reviewer and in the future by the reader. Discussion part demonstrates a solid understanding of the state-of-art in the research area and the knowledge of most important and current literature. The results are discussed in relation to the research of others and demonstrate a good understanding of the implications of the work in a border scientific context.

In my opinion, a very important part of the paper is attachment V covering 72 pages, where the author presents systemized information regarding medical rescue services in 27 European countries. This forms a magnificent source of knowledge making it possible to analyze the organizational solutions of functioning systems of pre-hospital rescue systems in the entire Europe.

References on 13 pages includes 225 items. Such broad range of references makes the stud to be a collection of the latest information with regard to the issue the Author addresses. The references are well chosen and up to date. The dissertation is written in a very clear way, illustrated with wellwritten figures, tables and edited with care.

Remarks:

- Polish translation of the summary is in some parts not identical with the original version, which does not always result in proper essence of the presented content.
- Thomas Wilp's dissertation is a very valuable source of information, which because of its research assumptions should go to a wide audience in all European countries. With respect to that, the selection of literature should in vast

majority include studies in English, whereas in this case 144 out of 225 positions are in German language.

- Both aims and conclusions in this work are only in a descriptive form. In my opinion drawing some main aims and then showing some points with major conclusions answering the assumptions in the work, would highly improve the legibility of analyzed topics.
- Editorial errors: - wrong numbering of the pages in table of contents (p. X), - lack of translation to English in part of the description used in figure 14 (p. 26).

Despite several organizational comments and remarks specifying certain aspects of PhD thesis, which are supposed to increase the publishing potential of the study, I wish to stress that they do not diminish the substantive value of the performed research, analyses and conclusions.

The PhD thesis written by Mr Thomas Wilp addresses very pressing and important problem. The dissertation is novel in the context of the analyses and discussion relating to the research results regarding the international references. The PhD Candidate performed his research meticulously and provided a critical evaluation of his own research results. The project as a whole generates significant new knowledge in a scientific area, especially in perspectives of creation a new model of Emergency Medical Services in Europe.

In conclusion, Thomas Wilp dissertation was planned and carried out in a proper manner and the results were discussed in a mature. The author demonstrated a broad knowledge of literature on issues related to the topic of work. The Author has achieved a high level of proficiency in analysing results and their discussion that should characterize the independent scientific work researcher. A few comments were made with the duty of reviewing and have no cardinal impact on the overall positive assessment of the thesis and could be easily corrected before publication of the results.

To sum up, I can state that the scientific value of presented Thomas Wilp research is undoubted and fulfil the criteria defined in art. 13 ust.1 ustawy z dnia 14 marca 2003r. o stopniach naukowych i tytule naukowym oraz o stopniach i tytule w zakresie sztuki (Załącznik do obwieszczenia Marszałka Sejmu RP z dnia 2 grudnia 2014r. - Dz. U. poz. 1852).

That is why I endorse, the Eminent Council of the Faculty of Health Sciences with Subfaculty of Nursing and Institute of Maritime and Tropical Medicine, Medical University of Gdańsk, recommendation of Thomas Wilp, for processing further stages of the doctoral programme.

Dr hab. n. med. Adam Nogalski

profesor nadzwyczajny

